CHAPTER 1: An introduction to the law of evidence

In the first chapter Practitioners are introduced to the principles of evidence: that evidence must be ‘relevant’ and evidence must be admissible.

1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 2
2. Explanation of the approach .................................................................................. 2
3. What is evidence? .................................................................................................. 3
4. Two key principles .................................................................................................... 3
5. Relevant evidence .................................................................................................... 3
6. Admissible evidence ................................................................................................. 4
6.1 What types of evidence are admissible? ................................................................. 5
6.2 What types of evidence are not admissible? ............................................................. 5
6.3 How is the question of admissibility of evidence dealt with in an arbitration? ........5
7. The degree or standard of proof ............................................................................... 6
8. The onus of proof .................................................................................................... 7
9. Which party must begin? Who leads evidence first? ............................................... 8
10. Direct evidence ..................................................................................................... 8
11. Indirect evidence .................................................................................................. 9
12. Links to other notes on evidence ........................................................................... 9

CHAPTER 2: The evidence of witnesses at a hearing or arbitration

This chapter discusses and explains the law pertaining to the evidence of witnesses in the context of hearings and arbitrations concerning a labour dispute. The skills involved in leading a witness, cross examination, re-examination as well as opening and closing statements are explained with examples.

2. Preparing A Witness To Give Evidence .................................................................. 3
2.1 Assessing Evidence Of Witnesses .......................................................................... 3
2.2 Who Should Be Called As A Witness? .................................................................... 4
2.3 Preparation Stages ................................................................................................. 4
2.4 Which Witness Should Be Called First? ................................................................. 5
2.5 The Sequence Of Witnesses .................................................................................. 5
2.6 How Good Is A Witness’s Eyewitness Evidence? .................................................. 7
3. Witnesses ................................................................................................................... 8
3.1 The General Rule .................................................................................................... 8
3.2 Who Cannot Be Called As A Witness? .................................................................... 9
3.3 Misconceptions About Who Can And Who Can Not Be Called To Be A Witness..... 9
3.4 What A Witness May Not Do ................................................................................. 10
3.5 What Happens If A Party Fails To Call A Relevant Witness? ............................... 10
5. Calling A Witness .................................................................................................... 12
6. Introducing A Witness In A Hearing Or Arbitration ................................................. 13
6.2 In An Arbitration .................................................................................................... 13
6.2 Checking For Pre-Hearing Procedural Fairness ...................................................... 14
7. Opening Statements ................................................................................................ 15
8. Leading A Witness .................................................................................................. 15
9. Leading Questions .................................................................................................. 16
10. Avoid Complex Questions .................................................................................... 17
11. Leading A Witness Through His Evidence ........................................................... 18
12. Preparing For Cross Examination ........................................................................ 18
13. Cross examination of a witness ............................................................................. 19
13.1 the right to cross examine .................................................................................... 19

© Labour Law Academy (Pty) Ltd and Sean Molony 2018. All rights reserved. Permission of the author is required in order to use the contents for any other purpose whatsoever other than for the information of the purchaser. The purchaser exempts and indemnifies the author, the publisher, the website and its affiliates from any claim for damages arising from reliance on the information contained in this document.
13.2 Relevant cross examination ................................................................. 20
13.3 Putting your case to the witness .......................................................... 21
13.4 Checking for collaboration, collusion or coaching ................................... 22
14. Re-examination ....................................................................................... 23
15. Hostile witnesses ...................................................................................... 24
15.1 What is a hostile witness? ...................................................................... 24
15.2 What can a representative do if his witness is hostile? ......................... 24
15.3 When is a witness not hostile? ............................................................... 24
16. Subpoenaing a witness ............................................................................ 24
17. Conclusion ................................................................................................. 25

CHAPTER 3: Documentary evidence
This chapter discusses and explains the law regarding documentary evidence presented in hearings and arbitrations. The discussion is highly practical in its approach to the subject matter with examples and suggestions given throughout.
1. Introduction .............................................................................................. 2
2. What is a ‘document’? ............................................................................. 2
3. Hearsay evidence ...................................................................................... 2
4. What document must be used? ............................................................... 2
5. Who must present a document? ............................................................. 3
6. Which documents must be admitted? .................................................. 3
7. Who must hand in a document? .............................................................. 3
8. Why should a document be disclosed? .................................................. 4
9. How to have documentary evidence admitted: discovery in arbitrations .... 5
10. Two stage process .................................................................................. 5
11. Which documents are protected from disclosure? .............................. 6
12. How to prepare a bundle of documents for presentation at a hearing or arbitration .................................................. 6
13. The role of the chair or arbitrator in the admission of documents ........... 6

CHAPTER 4: Specific types of oral evidence
This chapter discusses eye witness evidence, hearsay evidence, confessions, expert and opinion evidence and in camera evidence.
1. Introduction .............................................................................................. 3
2. How good is a witness’s eyewitness evidence? ...................................... 3
3. Presenting and assessing evidence regarding identification .................. 4
4. Hearsay evidence ...................................................................................... 5
4.1 What is hearsay evidence? .................................................................. 6
4.2 Case study A ......................................................................................... 6
4.3 The problem with hearsay evidence .................................................... 7
4.4 Is hearsay evidence never admissible in hearings and arbitrations? ....... 7
4.5 Hearsay evidence admitted by consent: s 3(1)(a) Law of Evidence Amendment Act. 8
4.6 Hearsay evidence admitted by the originator testifying: s 3(1)(b) .......... 8
4.7 Case study B ......................................................................................... 9
4.8 Case Study C ....................................................................................... 9
4.9 Hearsay evidence admitted in terms of s 3(1)(c). .................................. 9
4.10 Assessing hearsay evidence ............................................................... 10
4.11 Case Study D .................................................................................... 10
5. Confessions ............................................................................................. 11
6. Opinion evidence ..................................................................................... 11

© Labour Law Academy (Pty) Ltd and Sean Molony 2018. All rights reserved. Permission of the author is required in order to use the contents for any other purpose whatsoever than for the information of the purchaser. The purchaser exempts and indemnifies the author, the publisher, the website and its affiliates from any claim for damages arising from reliance on the information contained in this document.
CHAPTER 5: Specific types of documentary evidence

This article discusses a range of documents which are commonly presented as evidence in hearings and arbitrations, such as the minutes of a disciplinary hearing, polygraph test results, contracts of employment and notes of conversations.

1. Introduction ................................................................. 2
2. Contemporaneous notes .................................................. 2
3. Parol evidence rule .......................................................... 2
   Fixed term contract .......................................................... 3
   Exceptions to the rule ...................................................... 4
4. Polygraph evidence .......................................................... 4
   Leading case .................................................................. 4
   How polygraph evidence should be approached: best practice ............. 5
   How to have polygraph evidence admitted ........................................ 5
   How to oppose the admission of polygraph evidence .......................... 5
   Caution ........................................................................ 6
   Further recommended reading .............................................. 6
5. Previous statements ......................................................... 6
   The general rule .............................................................. 6
   Legislation ...................................................................... 7
   When can previous statements be admitted? ................................. 7

CHAPTER 6: The law of evidence—real evidence

This chapter discusses and explains the law regarding real evidence, that is the objects which are used to prove or disprove a case such as video and tape recordings, photographs and breathalysers.

1. Real evidence .................................................................. 2
2. Breathalysers and evidence regarding intoxication .......................... 3
   What is real evidence? ...................................................... 2
   Why is real evidence presented? ......................................... 2
   How to present real evidence ............................................... 2
   How to assess real evidence ............................................... 3

© Labour Law Academy (Pty) Ltd and Sean Molony 2018. All rights reserved. Permission of the author is required in order to use the contents for any other purpose whatsoever other than for the information of the purchaser. The purchaser exempts and indemnifies the author, the publisher, the website and its affiliates from any claim for damages arising from reliance on the information contained in this document.
CHAPTER 7: The law of evidence: special rules

This chapter discusses the law and gives examples of best practice pertaining to the situations where special rules of evidence have been developed by the courts. These rules are the cautionary rule, which applies to single witness, accomplice and other witnesses; entrapment; privilege; judicial notice of facts; similar fact evidence and illegally obtained evidence.

1. Evidence which should be treated with caution ........................................ 2
2. Accomplice evidence .................................................................................. 3
3. Case study ................................................................................................. 4
4. Evidence of a single witness ..................................................................... 4
5. Evidence by children .................................................................................. 4
6. Entrapment ................................................................................................. 5
7. Terms explained ......................................................................................... 5
8. Admissible? ............................................................................................... 5
9. Criminal law ............................................................................................. 6
10. Labour law .............................................................................................. 8
11. Who must prove entrapment? .................................................................. 8
12. Summary .................................................................................................. 8
13. Case study ............................................................................................... 9
14. Similar fact evidence ................................................................................ 9
15. The context .............................................................................................. 9
16. The problem ............................................................................................ 9
17. Definition .................................................................................................. 9
18. General rule ............................................................................................. 10
19. 4. Judicial notice: when evidence is not required .................................... 11
20. 5. Illegally obtained evidence .................................................................. 11
21. Representatives’ role ............................................................................... 12
22. Admitting illegally obtained evidence ..................................................... 12
23. 6. Privilege ............................................................................................. 14
24. Attorney/ client privilege ......................................................................... 14
25. Without prejudice .................................................................................... 14
26. Conciliation ............................................................................................. 15
27. Personal private documents ..................................................................... 15
3. Presenting circumstantial evidence ................................................................. 4
4. Assessing circumstantial evidence ................................................................. 4

CHAPTER 9: Limiting evidence in a hearing or arbitration

This article discusses the evidentiary impact of processes used to limit the amount of evidence presented at a hearing or arbitration, such as narrowing the issues, pre-arbitration conference, opening and closing statements.

1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 2
2. Narrowing the issues ....................................................................................... 2
CCMA Guidelines on Misconduct Arbitrations ...................................................... 3
Narrowing of the issues – making admissions ..................................................... 4
Admissions made in a hearing .......................................................................... 4
An arbitrator’s duty ............................................................................................ 4
How to narrow the issues ................................................................................... 5
Narrowing of the issues: dismissal ..................................................................... 6
Narrowing of the issues: unfairness ..................................................................... 7
Narrowing of the issues: grounds of dismissal ................................................... 7
Narrowing the issues: procedural and substantive fairness: misconduct ............. 7
Narrowing the issues: elements of misconduct .................................................. 8
Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 9
3. Admissions made in a pre-arbitration conference recorded in the minute .......... 9
CCMA Rules ......................................................................................................... 9
Are parties bound by a pre-arbitration minute? .................................................. 10
4. Admissions made in a ‘default’ arbitration ...................................................... 11
5. Opening statements ......................................................................................... 11
6. Closing statements .......................................................................................... 12

CHAPTER 10: The assessment of evidence

This chapter explains how evidence should be weighed or assessed by the chairperson or arbitrator.

1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 2
2. The CCMA Guidelines on Misconduct Arbitration .......................................... 2
3. The issues in dispute in a disciplinary hearing for misconduct .......................... 3
4. The issues in dispute in a disciplinary hearing regarding an allegation of poor performance ................................................................. 4
5. The issues in dispute in an arbitration after an employee referred a dispute alleging he has been dismissed on the ground of misconduct or poor performance ............ 5
5.1 Was the employee dismissed? ...................................................................... 5
5.2 Was the employee’s dismissal fair? ............................................................... 6
6. The onus .......................................................................................................... 7
7. What standard should be applied when assessing evidence in hearings and arbitrations? ....................................................................................................................... 8
8. Assessing the probabilities ............................................................................. 9
9. Assessing the credibility of a witness ............................................................. 10
10. Dealing with mutually destructive versions of evidence ............................... 13
11. The finding or award .................................................................................... 14

© Labour Law Academy (Pty) Ltd and Sean Molony 2018. All rights reserved. Permission of the author is required in order to use the contents for any other purpose whatsoever other than for the information of the purchaser. The purchaser exempts and indemnifies the author, the publisher, the website and its affiliates from any claim for damages arising from reliance on the information contained in this document.